## RICHARD T. FULCase 2:07-cv-04936-MAM Mode Transcript 52-5 Filed 10/01/10 Page 1 of 6 JULY 20, 2010

Page 22 Page 24 A No. Q Who in your chain of command told you to meet with a 2 Q Can you explain why I have an unsigned copy of your 2 person and aide them in an investigation who wasn't licensed in 3 report? 3 the state to be a private investigator? 4 A Not at this point, no. A I don't recall. I mean, the letter came to Lieutenant Q Can you explain how it could possibly even be gotten 5 Dougherty, but it would have came down through channels to me. 6 in my possession --Q Well, here's your complete file. Show me where you A No. 7 were given any assignment to meet with this person. Q -- if you have a signed one and nobody can get to your A My report was already completed. 9 word processing system? Q Why were you meeting with somebody then if your 10 A No. 10 investigation was completed? 11 Q Can I see your file, your entire file? In your file 11 A Based on this letter. 12 you have a card here from a person that named Varis K. Babris, Q Um-hum. This letter's from a township official asking 12 13 New Jersey State Police? 13 you to cooperate in their investigation to meet with this A I recall meeting him, yes. 14 investigator, correct, paraphrasing the length of it? 15 Q When did you meet him? MR. HENZES: It's not to him, to Lieutenant whatever A Oh, gees. I don't know. 16 16 his name is on there. 17 Q Where in your report do you indicate meeting him? 17 BY MR. PURICELLI: 18 A It would have been after my report was completed and Q Okay. Well, that's true. Asking your superiors to 19 submitted. And as I recall, he was an investigator assigned by cooperate with their investigation, correct? 20 the township who requested a copy of the report, if I'm not 20 A And to deliver the report, yes. 21 mistaken. It was a long time ago, so I can't tell you exactly 21 Q Okay. And how many times have you delivered one of 22 the date that he would have done that. 22 your investigation reports from CLEAN to an individual who's 23 Q Was he from the state -- New Jersey State Police? working for another person, a private investigator? 24 A He was a retired State Police lieutenant, and he was A This was the only time I've ever had a request to do 25 an investigator of some sort brought back to do --25 that. Page 23 Page 25 1 Q Meet him in Pennsylvania? Q So this is the only time it was done? 2 A I did. A Well, I can't say that. This is the only time I've 3 ever been requested to do it. 3 Q Pennsylvania has a -- has a law about private detectives, don't they? Q That's all you can give me, your information. How A I'm sure that they do. 5 many times did you meet with an individual that said he was a Q Did you check to see if he was licensed in the State 6 private detective and wasn't and gave him copies of a official 7 of Pennsylvania to conduct investigations? police report of the State Police? A I did not. A I met with this man and gave him a report, as I was Q Why not? 9 supposed to give to him. 10 A I don't know. I didn't. I just didn't. Q And who ordered you to give a copy of a State Police 11 Q Is it State Police policy to aide a person to commit a 11 CLEAN investigation? 12 crime? 12 A Whoever passed this on to me. And I assume it was my 13 A Absolutely not. 13 supervisor, Sergeant Sanders, that gave me this letter. Q Is it -- are you charged as a duty as a state trooper 14 Q How come you didn't put a note in your report here 15 to enforce the laws of Pennsylvania? 15 that showed that you were given an order by a superior to give 16 A Yes. 16 official State Police reports to a private citizen who's not 17 Q Isn't it a crime to act as a private detective when 17 even licensed in the state? 18 you're not licensed in Pennsylvania? 18 A I put this request in the file. That's what I put in 19 A If acting in a capacity of a private detective. 19 the file. Q What was the person that you were meeting acting in, 20 Q Would you agree with me there's nowhere in here to 21 what capacity? 21 verify what you're saying, that you were ordered to give an 22 A I don't recall. I mean, it's three years ago. But I 22 official police investigation of the State Police to a private 23 recall him coming to the headquarters. We got -- I got a 23 citizen? 24 message from my chain of command requesting that a copy of the 24 A I would have to agree with that. 25 report be provided. So I provided that report. Q Okay. And what rules and regulations are there with

Page 26

- 1 the State Police about passing off official State Police
- 2 reports to private citizens?
- 3 A Well, they are supposed to be subpoenaed by law, if
- 4 it's an official investigative report, criminal investigation.
- 5 This is a administrative investigation. So --
- 6 Q Did you have a subpoena?
- 7 A Not as I recall, no, or it would be here.
- 8 Q So you have no subpoena, and you have no direct
- 9 written order from a superior to pass off the record, correct?
- 10 A Not a written order, no.
- 11 Q And you don't recall a superior giving you the order?
- 12 A As I recall, no.
- 13 Q In your report, you can look at it, you'll see a fax
- 14 transmission dated 11/9/06. I'll help you. I think it's in
- 15 this packet here, to Corporal Hills.
- 16 A Um-hum.
- 17 Q The date on this transmission is 11/9/06?
- 18 A Okay.
- 19 Q It's from a Sergeant David Young, Montoursville, to a
- 20 Corporal Hills?
- 21 A It is.
- 22 Q The memo is NCIC entry, Officer Christopher Bush,
- 23 Newtown Police Department?
- 24 A Correct.
- 25 Q I've accurately described that?

Page 27

- 1 A Yes.
- Q Okay. Why is that in your report?
- 3 A Corporal Hills was, up until a few days after this
- 4 date, the audit and misuse unit supervisor. He retired a short
- 5 time thereafter. I can't recall the exact date, but I think it
- 6 was right around the beginning of the year.
- 7 Q Um-hum.
- 8 A And this would have been provided through Sergeant
- 9 Sanders and come to my desk as the investigator of the misuse.
- 10 Q Do you have any documents that says Sanders gave you
- 11 this?
- 12 A No.
- 13 Q What else did he give you that you can recall, if you
- 14 recall him specifically giving you this fax sheet?
- 15 A This and the e-mail from -- and he would have e-mailed
- 16 me this, not given me the hard copy, but this and the e-mail.
- 17 That's all.
- 18 Q Um-hum. What was with the fax transmittal sheet, if
- 19 anything?
- 20 A It would have been Trooper McDermott's report.
- 21 Q Do you recall that being the case?
- 22 A I recall seeing all this. Exactly when I received it,
- 23 when I personally received it, I don't recall that.
- 24 Q Do you recall?
- 25 A It would have been around -- it would have been around

Page 28
1 the time that Sergeant Sanders actually assigned me to do this

- 2 misuse investigation.
- 3 Q And your e-mail says about February 12th, 13th, 2007?
- 4 A That's what the e-mail says. That would be correct.
- Q Okay. And there's nothing in your report that you
- 6 created in this investigation about ever receiving this
- 7 information; is that true?
- A Yes, there is.
- 9 Q And who did you get it from?
- 10 A In my report I indicate that that was an enclosure to
- 11 my report.
- 12 Q It's an enclosure to your report which means you got
- 13 it during the course of your investigation?
- 14 A Or at the beginning. It's Enclosure 1, so --
- 15 Q And your investigation started, again, February 12th
- 16 or 13th?
- 17 A Mine did, that's correct.
- 18 Q You spoke with -- you spoke with a detective from
- 19 Tioga? You have his card in here?
- 20 A Right here, the last one, Michael Dasoy?
- 21 A Yes, um-hum.
- 22 Q Did he give it to you?
- 23 A Did he give me?
- 24 Q Those reports?
  - A He gave me court documents, PFAs, the court custody

Page 29

- 1 order, if I recall. And I don't recall him giving this to me,
- 2 no.

25

- 3 Q Why did you need all of that for whether or not an
- 4 entry was backed by a report or not?
- 5 A Why I did need all what?
- 6 Q PFAs and court orders if your investigation was
- 7 administrative and only whether or not a missing -- or an NCIC
- 8 entry was backed by a report?
- 9 A Well, the background of the investigation was based on
- 10 the custody of the children and whether or not the father had
- 11 legal custody. So for me to determine whether there was reason
- 12 to proceed and whether there was a reason to check NCIC, I
- 13 obtained all the background documents that I thought were
- 14 necessary.
- 15 Q Just so I understand your investigation. Your
- 16 investigation was to determine whether or not there was a
- 17 violation of the CLEAN Administrative Regulation, correct?
- 18 A Correct, um-hum.
- 19 Q And the CLEAN Administrative Regulation required an
- 20 entry to be backed by a report that contains the information in
- 21 the NCIC entry, correct?
- 22 A Correct.
- 23 Q Why did you need to know whether or not there had
- 24 existed a PFA for the children that were missing before?
- A Well, it was -- it was information from the

JULY 20, 2010 Page 30 Page 32 1 documentation that I had received, and I verified with the Q You didn't know that the person who was asking for the 2 courts that that was, in fact, the case in order to proceed. 2 investigation by you, Hile, was the person assigned to Q And part of the information that you had received was 3 investigate the trooper who was being accused? 4 the e-mail from Hile, correct, who said that there had been a A That's correct, at that point I didn't. 5 complaint made against one of their members by the person who 5 Q It's just a coincidence? 6 made the NCIC entry; isn't that true? A Yes, sir. A Say that -- part of the documentation that I received? Q In your experience of investigating how many times Q I'll say it a different way for you. I'll rephrase 8 have you run into such coincidences before, that the person 9 it. you're going to go investigate is the person making a complaint 10 A Go ahead. against a trooper who's being investigated by the person asking 11 Q The person who made the NCIC entry was Detective Bush? you to investigate the complaint? 12 A Correct. 12 A Quite honestly I don't care if there's an IAD 13 Q Christopher Bush? 13 complaint or not. My goal was to see if the entry overall --14 A Okay. 14 the end goal was to see if there was an entry in NCIC that was 15 Q And Detective Christopher Bush was identified in your justified. And after an hour or two or so interview at Newtown 16 e-mail of your assignment as a person making a complaint 16 Township Police Department these reports magically appeared. 17 against the State Police? 17 And subsequently the letter was sent out by Lieutenant A That's correct. 18 18 Ignatz saying we found that, you know, your reports were there, 19 Q State Police Sergeant Tripp up in the Montoursville the report -- or the entry was justified. And to that extent 20 area, correct? that was the end of my investigation. 21 A I don't know that it was that specific. 21 I filled out my report, sent it to my supervisor, and 22 Q Did you ever tell Ignatz that? 22 that was the extent of it. 23 A Did I ever tell him? 23 Q Until you got ordered by somebody to cooperate with 24 Q Yeah, that Sergeant Tripp was the subject of the BPR 24 the -- some private investigator? 25 investigation? 25 A Yeah. As I recall, I asked if it was okay for me to Page 31 Page 33 1 A I don't know. I don't recall whether I did or not. 1 give this report to this person. And I was told, yes, go ahead 2 Q Did the two of you discuss it as you were going down 2 and give the report. 3 the Turnpike to Newtown? Q But you don't know who it was that told you that? A I'm sure that we did. A I'm just assuming it was Sergeant Sanders, as he would 5 have received the letter from Lieutenant Dougherty I believe it 5 Q Why? A To -- so he had the background on why we were going to was e-mailed or addressed to. Newtown Township. Q Okay. And you definitely spoke with Young from Q You were going there to find out about an entry, not 8 Montoursville about this? 9 about a complaint against one of your own members; isn't that A I -- I -- I believe I recall speaking to him three 10 true? 10 years ago. 11 A That's correct. An entry, not a complaint. 11 Q And you never spoke to Hile? 12 Q Why was it important to mention that the person that 12 A No, I don't believe I did. 13 you were going to go look at had made a complaint against a Q Do you recall speaking to anybody that you can tell me 13 14 state trooper? 14 about that doesn't appear in your report? A Not that I recall. I mean, I remember Detective 15 A I don't know that I mentioned it or he read it in here 15 16 or --16 Dasoy. 17 Q Would you be surprised to know he testified that you 17 Q From Tioga? 18 did, he being Ignatz? 18 A I think he's a detective, yeah. 19 A Well, I very well could have. I don't recall our 19 Q Um-hum. Can you tell me why you don't have Young 20 exact conversation going down the road in a car three years 20 mentioned in your report? 21 ago. 21 A No. 22 22 Q Why would you even be mentioning that you're going Q You testified in a arbitration matter, in a hearing 23 down to Newtown to investigate an entry and the person who's 23 that was a arbitration?

25

24 making the entry made a complaint against a state trooper?

A I don't know, just conversation.

A I did? No.

Q Did you?

24

## Case 2:07-cv-04936-MAM Document 52-5 Filed 10/01/10 Page 4 of 6 ARD T. FULTZ JULY 20, 2010

Page 34
A No. For him?

- 2 Q For him, yeah. Did you know he got fired?
- 3 A I did know after the fact. I think Lieutenant Ignatz
- 4 might have been there. Somebody from PSP was there. I think
- 5 it was Lieutenant Ignatz. But I was not involved in that.
- 6 Q After -- after --
- 7 A As a matter of fact, after this report and after my
- 8 interview with Detective Bush and turning in a report, aside
- 9 from Lieutenant Ignatz indicating to me that he was going to a
- 10 hearing, that was the end of my involvement with this until --
- 11 until this --

1

- 12 Q Prior to --
- 13 A -- hearing today.
- 14 Q Prior to the date you went down to Newtown with
- 15 Lieutenant Ignatz how many times did a lieutenant accompany you
- 16 to any outside investigation?
- 17 A None.
- 18 Q So this was the first time?
- 19 A This was the first time.
- 20 Q Since that time how many times has a lieutenant
- 21 accompanied you?
- 22 A None. It was an opportunity. I was on my way, and I
- 23 walked by his office. And I said, are you doing anything
- 24 today, Lieutenant? And he said no, I don't think so. I said,
- 25 well, I'm riding down to Newtown Township. Do you want to go

## Page 35

- 1 along? And he said sure.
- 2 Q How many times have you invited him before that?
- 3 A He was new.
- 4 Q Okay. Since he was new, how many times have you
- 5 invited him to ride along with you?
- 6 A I hadn't had another misuse after this until he --
- 7 after he had left.
- 8 Q What about any of the investigation? You've had other
- 9 investigations since this time, right?
- 10 A Yeah.
- 11 Q Have you ever invited him to go with you on those
- 12 investigations?
- 13 A No. But I invited the new sergeant to go along with
- 14 us after Sanders -- after Sergeant Sanders. He left, I'm not
- 15 sure how long ago. But he transferred out, and we just got a
- 16 new sergeant, and the door's open.
- 17 Q When you went to Newtown Township they did produce to
- 18 you a police -- the police report we showed to you right,
- 19 Ignatz 2?
- 20 A Yes, after -- yes, after.
- 21 Q Did that end the conversation you had with either
- 22 Detective Bush or the chief?
- 23 A Concerning this matter? If it didn't end the
- 24 conversation, it was almost the end of the conversation, yeah.
- 5 Q Okay. Is there any reason you couldn't have just

1 picked up the phone and asked him to send you a copy -- send to

Page 36

- 2 you by fax or something a copy of the report showing the
- 3 information in the NCIC entry?
- 4 A No. Normally we do investigations in person though.
- 5 Q All of them?
- 6 A Yes.
- Q You've never done any by picking up the phone and say
- 8 just send us a copy of the report?
- A And not showing up?
- 10 Q Yeah.
- 11 A And talking to the person who made the complaint or
- 12 the target? No.
- 13 Q Okay. Well, in this case did you talk to the person?
- 14 Did you go out and have a physical contact with the person who
- 15 made the complaint about this entry being wrong?
- 16 A About whether or not there was an entry?
- 17 Q You just --
- 18 A I don't know where the initial complaint came from,
- 19 somewhere from up in Mansfield. And I know Detective Bush at
- 20 some point in time made an IAD complaint. I received the
- 21 documentation. I followed up on the documentation. I went and
- 22 interviewed Detective Bush in the presence of Chief Duffy at
- 23 the time and asked him to provide the report so that I could
- 24 see it.
- 25 Q Have you ever been told that a person -- ever been

Page 37

- 1 taught in the State Police that a person has a First Amendment 2 right to make a complaint against a police officer, including a
- 3 trooper?
- 4 A Absolutely.
- 5 Q Okay. And are you aware that you can't retaliate, not
- 6 you personally, but a person cannot be retaliated against?
- 7 A Absolutely.
- 8 Q Okay. So when you found out that the person that you
- 9 were going to go look into about making an entry had already
- 10 made a complaint against a state trooper, it didn't dawn on you
- 11 that you might be engaged in retaliatory conduct by doing this
- 12 investigation?
- 13 A No.
- 14 Q Never dawned on your mind?
- 15 A No.
- 16 Q But you did know that it was illegal?
- 17 A To retaliate?
- 18 Q To retaliate against a person?
- 19 A Absolutely. And my investigation was not retaliatory.
- 20 Q You never thought that somebody was using you as a
- 21 pawn?
- 22 A No.
- 23 Q Did you ever find out who made the complaint that you
- 24 were now investigating?
- 25 A Sergeant -- I believe Sergeant Young is where the --

Page 34 - Page 37

Page 38 Page 40 1 Sergeant Young to Sergeant Sanders, if I recall correctly. 1 Q What --Q Well, the e-mail says Hile? 2 2 A Because that's part of my report. A Okay. Hile. 3 Q Can you tell me what part of the CLEAN Administration Q Did you talk to Hile? 4 Act will be violated -- for you to have an administrative 5 violation of whether the brother of the person making the entry A I didn't talk to Hile. Q Did you call --6 obtained an order properly or improperly? A It was part of the packet that Detective Dasoy sent to A My investigation was completely separate from the IAD 8 investigation. 8 me. There was allegations that the court order obtained was 9 Q I'm not talking about that. 9 obtained fraudulently, which would mean, in turn, that the A Did I talk to Hile? No. 10 10 entry should not have been made. 11 Q Okay. And it's your testimony you didn't know Hile Q Entry was allowed if there was information to 12 was assigned to do the investigation against Tripp? 12 correlate with the entry, correct? 13 A No, I did not. A And it turned out that there was. 13 14 Q But you knew that there was a investigation? 14 Q There's no rule under the CLEAN Administration Act 15 about an order being valid or not, is there? 15 A I knew there was an investigation. Q Against Tripp? 16 A About a court order? 17 A Because it indicated in the e-mail. 17 Q Yes. On custody? 18 Q Um-hum. And you knew at that point also that someone A No, no. 18 19 couldn't be retaliated for making that mistake, for making that 19 Q Why were you asking about it? 20 complaint? 20 A Because it was part of the information that I received 21 A That's correct. You know --21 in my investigation. 22 Q And when you got to the point --22 Q You weren't investigating whether an order was valid 23 A -- if there's a police officer that does something 23 or not, were you? 24 wrong and an IAD complaint is filed, you know, that's okay, and 24 A No. 25 I would expect that. And I would expect that if they did 25 Q You weren't investigating whether an order was Page 39 Page 41 1 something wrong in Montoursville or Mansfield and a person, 1 obtained fraudulently or not, were you? 2 Detective Bush, had the grounds to file an IAD complaint, by A At that point in time, no. 3 all means that's his right to do that free from retaliation. 3 Q So how was it --That's why my administrative investigation had nothing A It just came out in my investigation. 5 to do with the IAD investigation. I was just concerned with Q As did the complaint against the state trooper too? 6 whether or not he made the entry. 6 Q If it had nothing to do with it, Corporal, why was it 7 Q And you say that that had nothing to do with your 8 specifically mentioned in the e-mail sent to you as your 8 investigation, correct? 9 assignment to investigate? A What had nothing to do with my investigation? 10 A My assignment was to investigate whether or not 10 Q The fact that the complaining party from Montoursville 11 Detective Bush misused the system by putting his -- his 11 was the subject of a BPR complaint that was made by the very 12 brother's children into NCIC and whether or not there was a 12 person you're going down to question? 13 report to justify him doing so. That was my role. A All I was asked to do was to -- to obtain enough 14 MR. PURICELLI: Okay. 14 information in my investigation to determine whether or not 15 (Discussion held off the record.) this police department, this agency with their ORI and this 16 BY MR. PURICELLI: detective, had the authorization and the supporting 17 Q All right. Corporal, it's your testimony that you documentation to actually make an NCIC entry. That was my --18 were only interested in the administrative end, whether there that was my responsibility. 19 was or wasn't a report? 19 That's exactly what I did. And once that information 20 A That's correct. 20 was provided to me, it's reported here, I find no violations of Q To verify that. Did you ask when you were in front of 21 21 CLEAN Criminal Justice Services Policy. 22 Duffy and Bush about an order, whether an order was or wasn't 22 Q So you would have had no reason then to be asking 23 fraudulently obtained? 23 Duffy or Officer Bush about jurisdictional issues? A I may have, because that was part of the pack -- I'm A Jurisdiction came up in my mind because obviously this 25 sure that I did, yes. 25 appeared to be of a personal nature to me.

	Page 42		JULY 20, 2010
1	Q Okay. I'm going to get to that in a second.	1	Page 44 Q Did you ask for a missing person's report?
2	A Okay.	2	
3	Q Is there anything in the N in the CLEAN		answer your question. Answer the first one.
4	Administration Act that talked about jurisdiction that you were		BY MR. PURICELLI:
5	supposed to investigate?	5	
6	A No.	6	
7	Q Was there anything in the CLEAN Administration Policy		filed to justify the NCIC entries that were made by Newtown
8	that talked about whether an officer who made the entry had a	1	Township Police Department, and for the next hour we got beat
9	personal involvement in it or not?		
10	A It does indicate in the CLEAN Administrative		up about being there for retaliation purposes and some other stuff.
	Regulation that the system is not to be used for a personal	11	
	nature.	12	Detective Bush made comments like, you know I don't have a report. Why are you even asking? And then all of a
13	Q Okay. It wasn't his children, correct?		
14	A That's correct.	14	sudden Chief Duffy reaches down and opened up his drawer and pulls this report out at the end of the interview.
15	Q And did you investigate to find out whether or not the	15	
	officer who made the entry had cleared it with his superiors to		report?
	make the entry?	17	
18	A Yes. I asked I don't know if I asked the pointed	18	
19		19	r S-r-
	authorization for Detective Bush to actually make that entry.	20	, , , , ,
21	Q And your investigation is to collect the facts, not		after the capital Bush. Do you see it?
	render opinions; is that true?	22	
23	A Yes.	23	
24			Detective Bush or what was asked? That is you that's the I,
	shouldn't allow Detective Bush to make the entry, and that		right?
		23	
1	Page 43	١.	Page 4:
	Detective Bush should have stepped to the side and another	1	The same were the state state into their. I asked
	police officer in the department made the entry?		Detective Bush for a copy of his missing person report that h
3		١.	s filed in conjunction with the NCIC entries that he made.
4		4	or opening of the steport,
5		1	didn't you? You typed this, didn't you?
6		6	S P
7	r r	7	y street of a solid for a
	, , , , , , , , , , , , , , , , , , , ,	1	3 particular type of report, didn't you?
9		9	The same of the sa
10		1	that he made.
	created on the date that it indicated it was created? What	11	
			A Whether he titled it missing persons, whether he

- 12 evidence do you have?
- 13 A Which report?
- 14 Q The --
- 15 A The Newtown Township report?
- 16 Q Right. What evidence do you have?
- 17 A I don't have any evidence of that.
- 18 Q Do you always make accusations that you don't think
- 19 the report is prepared on the date that it indicates and was
- 20 made up for you to come down and look at so that you could see
- 21 there's no violation? Are you alleging that is what happened?
- A No, I don't believe I was.
- 23 Q So why do you say it magically showed up?
- A I asked for the report at the beginning of the
- 25 interview.

- A Whether he titled it missing persons, whether he
- 13 titled it incident report, incident investigation, I asked for
- 14 the report that he filed in conjunction with the entries that
- 15 he made, period.
- 16 Q All right. So when he -- when you type the following
- 17 sentence, you put in quotations, did you record that? Did you
- 18 have a recorder to record his statement?
- 19 A Audio recording, no, I did not.
- 20 Q Did you write it as he was talking?
- A I wrote notes, yes, I did. 21
- 22 Q Where are your notes?
- 23 A I don't have them anymore. I would have transcribed
- 24 them on to the report.
- 25 Q So you destroyed your notes?